TSUKIJI
「生きた江戸文化」ここにあり！
A Last Vestige of Edo Culture

Theodore C. Bestor / David Leibowitz

Recent Activities at I-House / Program Calendar / I-House & Me
Dialogue

TSUKIJI
「生きた江戸文化」ここにあり！
A Last Vestige of Edo Culture

Theodore C. Bestor
Social anthropologist

David Leibowitz
Tuna trader

At Tokyo's Tsukiji Fish Market, you are immediately immersed in the lively cries of the workers and the traffic of "turret trucks" nimbly weaving their way through the crowds. Now, with the worldwide boom in Japanese cuisine, Tsukiji has literally become the world's pantry. The market, however, is slated to move to a new location in Toyosu in the fall of 2016, and many already mourn the passing of its longtime home. We invited two experts with an abiding love for Tsukiji—a social anthropologist and a tuna trader who used to work at Tsukiji—to talk to us about its enduring attractions.

築地魚市場に一目ぼれ？

Theodore Bestor: I first encountered Tsukiji 30 years ago as a student. My wife and I were dirt poor, but somehow made friends with a local sushi chef. We'd ask him a lot of questions about fish and such, and one night he and his apprentices offered to take us to Tsukiji—which we'd never heard of before. We went on a lark, but it was like a trip to Mars [laughs]. I could hardly understand anything about what was going on. The atmosphere of the place completely blew my mind. Then, maybe a decade later I was back in Tokyo to study the Japanese commercial distribution system, and I visited Tsukiji again, thinking to interview a few people. At that point my Japanese was much better, I had
Theodore C. Bestor
テオドール・C・ベストー

1951年米国イリノイ州生まれ、ハーバード大学社会文化人類学教授。同大学ラテンアメリカ研究科教授。日本の研究に従事し、89年から14年間にわたり澤木を、"Tsukiji: The Fish Market at the Center of the World"（カリフォルニア大学出版、2004年、日本語版「築地」は本未名より2007年刊行）を完成させた。澤木は米国人類学協会経済人類学部門2006年度優秀賞ほか多数の賞を受賞。現在の研究テーマは日本の食文化の伝統と取引の世界的意義。

Born in Illinois in 1951. Professor of Social Anthropology and Director of the Reischauer Institute of Japanese Studies at Harvard University. In 1989 he began the research that would culminate in the publication of Tsukiji: The Fish Market at the Center of the World (University of California Press, 2004; Japanese translation from Kirakusha in 2007), which has won a number of awards, including the Society of Economic Anthropology Best Book Award for 2006. His current research examines traditional Japanese food culture and the global popularity of Japanese cuisine.

す。そうしたら、今度は完全にのめりこんでしまいまし
た。「こんなに面白い場所は世界中どこを探してもな
い！」そう確信した私は、以来、築地市場の研究に没頭
し、2004年にその成果を本にまとめました。

David Leibowitz: I've read it, and it's an honor to
have this chance to talk about it with you in person.
My encounter with Tsukiji was sort of haphazard. I
was in the used clothing business here in Japan,
but in about 1997 I became friends with this fresh
tuna dealer and he took me to lunch in Tsukiji. As you
say, it just blew my mind. The aroma of fish and the
sea, the bustle and noise of the market, and the guys
running around in every direction. There was some-
thing there for every one of the senses, and for me
Tsukiji was love at first sight. So I just jumped feet
first into this unknown world and spent a year and a
half there apprenticing at a tuna wholesaler's shop.

A Glimpse of Edo Culture

Bestor: One of the things I love about Tsukiji is the
people working there. The market is a tough job with
terrible hours, but people are enjoying themselves.
The auctioneers, the wholesalers, the chefs coming
to buy fish directly—they laugh, they joke, they kid
around. I think the unique culture and business prac-
tices of Tsukiji are rooted in the web of human
relations built up in these day-to-day exchanges.

Leibowitz: I agree. Tsukiji is just overflowing with
chaotic human energy. But in the midst of that
chaos there is also a strange sense of order. I feel
like it has something to do with the concept of
bushido that was born out of the feudal system
制度から生まれた武士道の概念に通じるように感じられるんです。よくも悪くも、皆が自身の役割や責任をつきまえていて、おのおのの仕事を全うすることに誇りを持っている。

ベストー：武士道とは思いませんが、確かな築地は、17世紀にさかのぼる江戸文化が今にも息づく数少ない場所と言えます。江戸時代の武術に見るような「型」の存在もその一つ。例えば、マグロを解体するときは刀のように長い包丁を使って数人がかりてさばきますよね。一人は柄の部分、もう一人はタオルを巻いた刃先を握るため、呼吸が合わなければ非常に危険です。それだけに基本の所作と言うべき型の修練が必要になる。包丁鳴きを学ぶ弟子たちは、ただ研ぐのではなく、「正しく」研がなくてはならない。魚選びの際も、型はとても重要な要素の一つです。形や大きさが不揃いなものは使い勝手が悪いし、尾が反り上がっているような魚は、釣り上げられる際に激しく暴れれた可能性があり、それは味に直接影響しますから。

リポウィッチ：仲間たちの「目利き」の能力には本当に関心されます。築地で働き始めた頃は、彼らが何を見て魚の質を判断しているのか、全くわかりませんでした。僕にはどれも同じに見えましたから（笑）。

ベストー：魚の良し悪しはもちろん、仲間たちは顧客である料理人がどんなレベルの魚を求めているかも熟知していますよね。彼らの会話を聞いてみると、単に魚の状態や価段の話ではなく、「これはいい上物だけど、お客のお客さんにはちょっと高すぎるので、こっちのほうがいいよ」といったやりとりが交わされて

of the Edo period. There's a hierarchy in which everyone knows their roles and responsibilities, for better or worse, and takes pride in doing their job to the best of their abilities.

Bestor: I don't think of it as bushido, but, yeah, I'd say Tsukiji is one of the last vestiges of the Edo cultural tradition going back to the 17th century. One aspect of this is the kата, or forms, like in the Edo-period martial arts. There's a proper way to do anything. For example, when you are carving up a tuna, the right way is for one apprentice to grab the hilt of the knife and the other to grab the end of the blade, wrapped in a towel—if they are not working together in harmony it's very dangerous. Which is why mastering the basic kата is so important. The apprentice doesn't just learn how to sharpen a knife—he learns how to sharpen it the right way. When choosing fish, the kата—the literal shape—of the fish is also quite important. Mismatches in size and proportions make them difficult to use in the kitchen; a crooked tail might mean the fish struggled violently when caught, and this will affect the flavor directly.

Leibowitz: The eye the wholesalers have for fish is truly incredible. When I began working at Tsukiji I had no idea what it was they were looking at to determine the quality of the fish. They all looked the same to me [laughs].

Bestor: The wholesalers don't just know good from bad fish—they know exactly what level of quality their clients are looking for. They don't just talk price or condition of the fish but say things like, “Yeah, this fish is really good, but it's probably too expensive for your customers. This would be

David Leibowitz
デイヴィッド・リポウィッチ
1968年米国ニューヨーク市生まれ。DML株式会社代表取締役。93年に来日し、以来日本文化に親しみを示す日々に漬れる市場の大漁業者「山守」で1年半勤務。その後2000年に氷野・冷凍マグロおよび加工品を製造するDML株式会社を創業。Isumo Foodsブランドを展開している。その活動は『ジャパン・タイムズ』などで紹介された。

Born in New York City in 1968, President of DML Venture Enterprises. Came to Japan in 1993 and, while still unfamiliar with Japanese culture, apprenticed for a year and a half with the tuna wholesaler Yamawa in Tsukiji. In 2000, he founded the tuna processing and export company DML and its brand Isumo Foods. His activities have been introduced in the Japan Times and other venues.
いる。つまり、日々のコミュニケーションを通じて顧客の要望をくみ取り、それに誠実に応えています。単なるモノの売り買いではなく、価値関係なんですね。そうした商人の心意気も、日本橋で河岸が栄えた江戸時代中期から脈々と受け継がれてきた日本の文化的価値の一つでしょう。

自然から命をいただく

ベストー：日本の文化を引き継ぐものとして、築地市場横の波除神社もとても興味深いですね。境内には卵、エビ、魚、ハマグリ、すしなどの塩がある、時折、参拝に訪れる仲間や料理人の姿を見かけます。「生きるために食べる」ことに感謝するという、人間以外の生き物の命に対する倫理感です。さきたままで生きていたものを、食するために殺すことへの敬意もあります。それは日本特有の考え方がかもしれないんです。スペインや米国では魚市場の近くにカトリックの祠を見かけましたが、それらは魚や食物のためのものではなく、海で亡くなった漁師を祀るものでした。

リボウィッツ：ユダヤ教にはコーシャという食事規定がありますが、本来これは動物をどう扱うかという倫理を示したものなんですね。神道の、自然から命をいただくという考えに、少し似ているかもしれません。人間以外にも魂があるという考え方はとても興味深いです。西洋は一般的に征服欲や消費欲が強く、魚がほしい、魚がそこにある、そうしたたとえそれが最後の１匹だとしてもその魚を捕りに行くというメンタリティーがある。逆に日本人は、自然や環境に対して共存意識を強く抱いているように思えます。

ベストー：ユダヤ教とキリスト教は、原則的に自然の

exactly what you want. They understand their clients’ needs through daily communication, and respond to them faithfully. It’s not just a business transaction, it’s a relationship of trust. In fairly significant ways, such as this sort of give-and-take among tradespeople, what now is Tsukiji can be traced back to the Nihonbashi Fish Market that started in the early 18th century—a living inheritance of Edo culture.

Taking Life with Gratitude

Bestor: In terms of Japanese cultural heritage, Namiyoke Shrine right beside the Tsukiji Market is a really fascinating place. On the grounds of the shrine there is a row of monuments to eggs, fish, shrimp, clams, sushi—and the people associated with the market stop by from time to time to pay their respects. There’s a sense of ethical engagement with other aspects of the living world—that in order to live, we must eat. And since in order to eat, we must take life, it should be done with respect and gratitude. This may be something unique to Japan. In Spain or in the United States you might find a Catholic shrine near the fish market, but that’s not for the fish, it’s for the fishermen—the men who lost their lives on the sea.

Leibowitz: In Judaism there is the practice of keeping kosher, which is really a body of laws and rules about how to treat animals ethically. In a sense, it’s similar to the Shinto idea of gratitude for the life we are taking from nature—the sense that there is a soul or spirit in forms of life other than the human, which is really interesting. In the West the desire to conquer and consume is strong. The mentality that says: I want some fish, there’s the fish, let’s go get the fish—even if it’s the very last one. In contrast the Japanese seem to me to have a
stronger sense of coexisting with nature and being stewards of the environment.

Bestor: The Judeo-Christian religions essentially put humans above nature. If you look at the underlying philosophies of Shinto and traditional, preindustrial Japan there is much more of a sense that humans and nature are integrated. You see it in the Shinto celebration of the seasons, the periods of planting and harvest.

Leibowitz: I think the sense of harmony with nature and wanting to eat naturally is why the Japanese came up with the idea of eating sushi and sashimi.

Bestor: At least in North America the only kind of raw seafood I can think of that has traditionally been eaten is oysters. Many Western cuisines depend on cooking techniques, spices, and sauces to transform raw ingredients. On the other hand, the basic principle of washoku—traditional Japanese cuisine—is that the underlying characteristics of the ingredients themselves should be self-evident. Traditionally, North Americans and Europeans have had little familiarity with the notion that eating seafood or animal products raw can be safe. I was born in central Illinois, which is over a thousand kilometers from the nearest seashore. If somebody had come up to me and said, “Here’s some rice and I put some really delicious raw fish on it, try it,” I would have run screaming from the house [laughs]. Sushi and sashimi are very recent things in North America, and in Europe as well, and the appreciation for raw seafood nowadays is a direct result of Japanese influence.

**Washoku as a Vehicle of Japanese Culture**

Bestor: In the past couple of decades, sushi and sashimi have been among the fastest growing food categories in the United States. Yet most of it is not being handled by trained Japanese chefs, with their eye for quality, and that’s a big problem. Sushi is not just slapping some raw fish on top of rice; the fundamentals of the traditional knowledge and craft that go into it aren’t getting properly transmitted. I’ve met a number of people in the professional cooking world who now go on about umami, the fifth flavor. “I spent six weeks in Japan and all I did was make dashi [stock] and learn the difference between the types of konbu [kelp] I should use for it.” But these are guys who never even heard of konbu, dashi, or umami when they were in cooking school…

Leibowitz: It’s the same with the sanitary aspects: no matter how many rules you make, it seems
わからない、今や多くの外国人シェフが「うまみ」について談すと誇りが高まります。彼らは得意気な「日本で和食を勉強した6週間のあいだ、ひたすら出汁を作って、昆布の塩を学んできたよ」と言います。でも、そんな人たちに限って料理学校では昆布や出汁、うまみのことなど、聞いたこともなかったりするんですよね。

リボウィッツ：衛生面でも同じで、いくらルールを作っても海外の日本食はなかなか日本のすし屋ほど清潔にならないですね。生ものを扱うことに対して、人々が意識的になるような文化的構築が必要です。

ペスター：私は次の本で、和食とは何かについて書く予定です。調理法や見た目の美しさだけでなく、伝統芸術から宗教的信仰、日常的な作法、人々の社会的なつながりにおいて、あらゆる文化的な側面を絡めて和食を説明したいと思っています。和食というのは単なる料理という次元を超えて、いわば世界観を表している。それを説明できたならと思います。

移転への不安と期待

リボウィッツ：築地の移転はすでに東京都が決定し、2016年秋には豊洲に河岸がオープンしますね。場内で長く営業をしてきた業者の内には、移転に伴う経済的負担から、これを機に店を立たせようとする動きが見えます。昔ながらの築地の姿が失われていくと思うと、残念ではありません。それに「築地」という名は、今や世界に通用する大きなブランド力になっています。

ペスター：そうですね。築地の「場」としての文化的価値が、意外にも過小評価されているのは残念です。例えば、誰がリピートをアリゾナに移転させて、改名したりするでしょうか。考えられないですね。豊洲への移転はそのぐらいの衝撃があるのですよね。ただ、移転の必要性を認めざるを得ない部分もあります。築地市場が創設されたのは1935年ですから、施設はもうボロボロです。その懐かしい雰囲気が、私にとっては好きなですね。その姿を記録に残しようと、松竹が映画を製作していて、私も少しばかり協力しました。豊洲に移れば、より衛生的で安全で効率的な環境になることでしょう。豊洲に移った人たちが満足する仕事ができ、最高の水産物を世界中の最高基準の料理人たちに供給し続けてくれることを、心から望みますね。

impossible to get overseas Japanese restaurants to keep things as clean as a sushi restaurant in Japan. There has to be a cultural construct that informs people of how to handle raw food.

Leibowitz: The Tokyo Metropolitan Government has decided to move the market to Toyosu, to reopen in the fall of 2016. But I hear a lot of long-time Tsukiji dealers are planning on quitting the business entirely due to the financial burden of the move. When I think about the loss of Tsukiji, this last vestige of Edo, I am heartbroken. And this is despite the fact that “Tsukiji” is like a brand name known around the world.

Hopes and Fears of Relocation

Leibowitz: The Tokyo Metropolitan Government has decided to move the market to Toyosu, to reopen in the fall of 2016. But I hear a lot of long-time Tsukiji dealers are planning on quitting the business entirely due to the financial burden of the move. When I think about the loss of Tsukiji, this last vestige of Edo, I am heartbroken. And this is despite the fact that “Tsukiji” is like a brand name known around the world.

Bestor: Yes, it's a shame how underappreciated Tsukiji is in terms of its cultural value as a specific place. Would someone move Hollywood to, say, Arizona, and rename it? No. The move of Tsukiji to Toyosu provokes that kind of shock. Though there are many things about the move I can understand: the physical plant of Tsukiji dates from 1935, so it's getting pretty shabby. To me it's kind of a nostalgic shabbiness, so I like it. Shochiku is now shooting a film to make a record of Tsukiji, and I participated a little bit in making it.* Toyosu probably will be a cleaner, safer, more efficient working environment. I certainly hope that Toyosu is a success. I hope that people who have to move there continue to find it a satisfying place to work and that it continues to be able to supply the best seafood in the world to some of the best chefs in the world.

* The documentary film Tsukiji Wonderland (tentative) portraying the four seasons of Tsukiji and traditional Japanese food culture will be released by Shochiku Co., Ltd. (production and distribution) in 2016.

この対談は2015年6月23日に行われたものです。
This dialogue was conducted on June 23, 2015.