Addressing Challenges to Educational Opportunity with Behavioral Science

Prof. Bridget Terry Long, Ph.D.
Saris Professor of Education and Economics
Harvard University, Graduate School of Education

Behavioral Science & Policy Association Annual Conference
September 19, 2017

College Enrollment Rate, 1965-2015
By Family Income Quartile (18 to 24 year olds)

Source: U.S. Census Bureau; School Enrollment Data, graph by Pell Institute, July 2014. Note: Rate is tabulated based on the total number in the cohort year and includes those that have not completed high school in the denominator of the tabulation.
Long & Mabel (2012) Analysis of Ohio Public Four-year Colleges

Continuous Persistence in Higher Education by Income Quintile

Source: Ohio Board of Regents administrative records. Sample: First-time college freshmen between the ages of 17 and 20 who enrolled at least half-time during fall 2002. Persistence outcomes are conditional on enrollment in all preceding semesters. Upper bound limits for income quintiles are: Q1 = $17,916; Q2 = $33,377; Q3 = $53,162; Q4 = $84,016.

Higher education is an expensive, but also necessary, investment for most to reach a middle-class standard of living...

Meanwhile, there are large, continual gaps in enrollment, persistence, and completion by income and race...

...and these trends are happening in the midst of changing demographics and increasing student needs.
The Role of Information?

Affordability and academic preparation are barriers—but common among both are complex processes, the need to sort through complicated information, doing the right things at the right time in the right order.

- Too little information
- Too much information
- Bad/incorrect information
- Unclear processes
- Late information
- Cumbersome applications

Information is a Cost...

Costly to collect the needed information, costly to sort through that information, costly to process the information to make a choice.

Just a few steps in the College Process...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SAT/ACT</th>
<th>College search</th>
<th>College applications</th>
<th>College choice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fee waivers</td>
<td>College search tools</td>
<td>Choices</td>
<td>Award letter interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registration</td>
<td>College literature</td>
<td>Fee waivers</td>
<td>Guidance on choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exam prep</td>
<td>Determining match</td>
<td>Common App</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score sending</td>
<td>College Visits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retaking exam</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAFSA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAFSA completion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAR interpretation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAFSA verification</td>
<td>Placement exams</td>
<td>Housing applications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplementary loan applications</td>
<td>Health insurance applications and waivers</td>
<td>Degree and Major Academic Requirements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The process is not obvious by logic or intuition. Many students aren’t sure what questions to even ask.

“I felt like I had arrived in a different country, one where I didn’t understand the customs, language, or culture.”
**Challenge: Navigating a Complicated System**

*Students are shut out due to poorly-understood processes unrelated to learning and education*

*Better information might be an effective way to improve outcomes*

**What we have currently doesn’t work well...**
- Non-specific information
- Information posted is overwhelming; treats all facts equally
- Many focus on building websites but do little outreach

**Lessons from Behavioral Economics:**

*The important role of information and how it is presented*

---

**Example: The FAFSA (federal financial aid form)**

*(the 2009 form minus the instructions)*
Helping with the FAFSA
(Bettinger, Long, Oreopoulos, & Sanbonmatsu, 2012)

**Intervention in H&R Block offices:**
- Transferred tax information into the aid form
- Streamlined remaining questions
- Gave individualized estimate, submitted electronically

The FAFSA Treatment increased college enrollment 26% among graduating high school seniors

Three Years Later... students were just as more likely to be enrolled 2 consecutive years than the control group

A form would have deterred them, but they had the skills necessary to persist in college

---

The Early College Planning Initiative
(Long and Bettinger, 2017)

**Why don’t more Families Save for College?**

1,000 Boston Public School families
Students Grades 7-10

Workshops on how to prepare academically and financially for college

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interventions (2013-14)</th>
<th>Opened Account</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group: Informational workshop</td>
<td>0.98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Group #1: Above + assistance with the 529 app</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Group #2: Above + funds to open account ($50)</td>
<td>24.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Longer term, families started saving monthly and saved on average $1200 more (without additional interventions)
Providing Information inside the Classroom
“Experimental Evidence of Professor Engagement on Student Outcomes”
(Carrell, Kurlaender, Bhatt, 2016)

- Feedback and suggestions in introductory microeconomics courses → Two strategically-timed emails to students from the professor indicating:
  - Knowledge of the students’ current standing in the course
  - Keys to success in the class
  - Reminder of when the professor is available

- Students in the treatment group scored higher on exams, homework assignments, and final course grade; some evidence that spend more time on homework

Lessons and Implications
- Targeted, timely information can be impactful, but it is not always enough
  - Effective in promoting small tasks
  - Failed to get families to complete complicated processes

- With complicated processes...
  - Assistance, and even incentives, might be necessary along with proactive outreach
  - Getting over an initial hurdle can set students up for continued engagement and enable to access resources

- Change the infrastructure to make processes clearer and easier to navigate
- Adjust messaging and provide timely support