INTRODUCTION

Photosynthetic organisms in the modern ocean fix approximately 4,000 Tmol of CO₂ to organic carbon every year (Field, Behrenfeld, Randerson, & Falkowski, 1998), accounting for nearly half of global net primary production (NPP). More than 99% of the resulting organic carbon is reoxidized in the water column or in sediments (Hedges & Keil, 1995), supporting heterotrophic communities in a wide variety of environments, and exerting a major influence on the distribution of oxygen in the water column. Organic carbon availability also governs the cycling of sulfur and iron in sedimentary systems, which influence global redox budgets and generate many of the chemical and isotopic records that record information about both ancient and modern ocean chemistry (e.g. Fike, Bradley, & Rose, 2015; Poulton & Canfield, 2010; Sperling et al., 2015). The distribution of nutrients and organic material in the Proterozoic ocean likely played a role in creating these patterns, and in determining the structure of marine ecosystems (e.g., Johnston et al., 2012).

The rate of net primary production is determined by the supply of nutrients, in particular phosphorus, to the photic zone. Though nitrogen and iron may be locally or transiently limiting, phosphorus is thought to be the globally limiting nutrient today, as diazotrophic primary producers can access the vast pool of atmospheric N₂ in the event of nitrogen scarcity (Tyrrell, 1999), an argument that likely holds for Proterozoic environments as well (Laakso & Schrag, 2018). Bioavailable phosphate ions are supplied to the oceans via weathering of apatite, but at a rate of <300 Gmol P/year (Benitez-Nelson, 2000), enough to support less than 1% of modern productivity. The remaining 99% of carbon fixation is instead associated with recycled phosphorus: organic phosphorus is remineralized during heterotrophic respiration in the water column and sediments, and then returned to the photic zone via upwelling where it can be reused. Zones of intense upwelling are therefore associated with intense productivity, but diffuse upwelling of a well-mixed, deep ocean P reservoir allows for productivity to occur in pelagic waters, which in fact dominate total productivity (Dunne, Sarmiento, & Gnanadesikan, 2007). Efficient recycling of nutrients is therefore central in setting the rate and structure of NPP in the modern ocean.

The rate of phosphorus recycling has likely varied over Earth history, because remineralization rates generally depend on the availability of
oxygen. In low-\(O_2\) environments, slower remineralization kinetics allow a larger proportion of organic material to sink through the water column (Van Mooy, Keil, & Devol, 2002) and be buried in sediments (Katsev & Crowe, 2015). This suggests that, in periods of Earth history when oxygen levels were low, a smaller fraction of organic matter would have been remineralized, leading to lower rates of phosphorus recycling and net primary production, and a reduced importance of upwelling in setting the spatial pattern of NPP. The Proterozoic and Archean eons had atmospheric oxygen levels of roughly 1% and <0.001% of present-day levels, respectively (see Lyons, Reinhard, & Planavsky, 2014; for a summary), suggesting potentially very large changes to remineralization, and thus to productivity (Kipp & Stüeken, 2017).

There are many challenges to arriving at a more quantitative assessment of the relationship between \(O_2\) and NPP. Any changes in organic carbon cycling have implications for the oxygen and phosphorus budgets, both of which must remain balanced on long timescales. Kipp and Stüeken (2017) recently argued that efficient burial of organic material in the oxidant-poor Precambrian oceans would have reduced oceanic phosphorus concentrations, suppressing productivity and thus \(pO_2\). However, the increase in organic burial would itself have led to additional oxygen production, so it is not clear that the proposed qualitative budget is balanced on geological timescales. In this study, we calculate rates of net primary production that are consistent with balanced global budgets for oxygen and phosphorus in the low-oxygen environments of the Proterozoic.

## 2 | MODEL AND METHODS

We explore this problem using two simple conceptual models of the phosphorus and oxygen cycles, developed below. We also compare these results to a recently published model of ocean/atmosphere biogeochemistry, which explicitly tracks the coupled cycles of \(O_2\), \(P\), \(Fe\), \(S\), \(H_2\), and \(CH_4\) (Laakso & Schrag, 2017).

### 2.1 | Global mass balance

The first conceptual model is a simple global mass balance for \(P\) and \(O_2\) that yields a simple expression for NPP in terms of oxygen-sensitive carbon cycling processes. A mass balance approach ensures calculations of NPP are for steady-state conditions given a particular oxygen level. We use this model to place bounds on the magnitude of NPP at different points in Earth history.

A steady-state oxygen cycle balances the oxygen source, burial of organic carbon, against various oxidative sinks:

\[
\epsilon_{org,NPP} = g(pO_2) \tag{1}
\]

where NPP is the rate of net primary production in mol C/year. \(\epsilon_{org}\) is the fraction of net primary production that is ultimately buried in marine sediments, again measured in mol C/year, and the sink function, \(g\), is a monotonically increasing function of atmospheric \(pO_2\) representing the globally averaged oxidation kinetics of reduced iron, sulfur, carbon, and volcanic gases. Some processes, such as subaerial pyrite oxidation (Holland, 1984) and \(H_2\) oxidation in the atmosphere (Goldblatt, Lenton, & Watson, 2006), are not monotonically increasing functions of oxygen concentration. However, these are either insensitive to or vary relatively weakly with \(pO_2\) at levels above those of the Archean. This suggests that the sink for oxygen, \(g\), was smaller during the moderately oxygenated Proterozoic than during the highly oxidized Phanerozoic. Therefore, low levels of oxygen could only have been sustained through the Proterozoic if the source of oxygen was also smaller than it is today:

\[
x^\prime < \epsilon_{org,NPP} \tag{2}
\]

where \(x\) denotes a value in the Phanerozoic, and \(x^\prime\) its value during the Proterozoic. In order to understand how \(\epsilon_{org}\) may have varied over time, we decompose it into two factors, \(\epsilon_{org} = f_1 f_2\). The term \(f_1\) is the “export efficiency”, or the fraction of net primary production, measured in terms of organic carbon, that is delivered to the sediments. \(f_2\) is the “burial efficiency”, or the fraction of the organic carbon delivered to sediments that is ultimately buried. The relative rate of net primary production is then given by:

\[
\frac{NPP'}{NPP} < \frac{f_1 f_2}{(f_1 f_2)'} \tag{3}
\]

Both the export and burial efficiencies increase in low-oxygen environments (see Section 4.1 for a detailed discussion), implying that rates of net primary production were likely lower during the Proterozoic than they were today. Rates of net primary production are controlled by the rate of supply of the limiting nutrient, assumed to be phosphorus during the Proterozoic (Laakso & Schrag, 2018). To ensure Equation (3) is consistent with a closed phosphorus budget, we next consider a steady-state \(P\) cycle.

Phosphorus is introduced to the marine system primarily by weathering of apatite. A portion of this \(P\) is in the form of detrital minerals or is adsorbed to particulates and is not bioavailable. We will ignore this portion of the supply, and focus on the bioavailable supply of weathered \(P\), while noting that the bioavailability of weathered \(P\) has likely varied over geologic time. This input must be balanced by burial of \(P\). Organic matter is the dominant shuttle for \(P\) supply of weathered \(P\), while noting that the bioavailability of authigenic phosphorus mineral phases following remineralization (Ruttenberg & Berner, 1993). Therefore, steady-state phosphorus cycling can be written as:

\[
W_P = \frac{\epsilon_{org,NPP}}{\rho} \tag{4}
\]

where \(W_P\) is the rate of bioavailable phosphorus release via weathering measured in mol P/year, and \(\rho\) is a globally averaged ratio of organic carbon to total phosphorus in marine sediments. In general, anoxic sediments retain less \(P\) due to some combination of preferential remineralization of \(P\)-rich compounds (Van Cappellen & Ingall,
and to less efficient retention of remineralized P (Colman & Holland, 2000). Though the relative roles of the two effects remain debated (e.g., Anderson, Delaney, & Faul, 2001), sedimentary $C_{org}:P$ ratios, where $P_z$ represents the sum of both organic and inorganic phosphorus phases in the sediment, are oxygen-sensitive (Algeo & Ingall, 2007). Note that these global budgets do not depend on the C:P ratio of organic matter directly, but rather on the ratio of organic carbon burial to total P burial, $\rho$.

Combining the steady-state oxygen (3) and phosphorus (4) budgets produce a set of internally consistent rules regarding biogeochemical cycling in the Proterozoic:

$$\frac{\text{NPP}'}{\text{NPP}} < \frac{f_1 f_2}{f_1 f_2 + 1}$$  \hspace{1cm} (5a)

$$\frac{W_p}{W_p} < \frac{\rho}{\rho'}$$ \hspace{1cm} (5b)

$$\frac{A'}{A} = \frac{f_1 f_2 P'}{(f_1 f_2 + 1) \rho}$$ \hspace{1cm} (5c)

where $A = \frac{\text{NPP}}{W_p}$, the rate of net primary productivity normalized to nutrient inputs from weathering. The first relationship describes the relative rates of net primary production that is consistent with a balanced oxygen budget, given changes in organic carbon cycling. The second relationship describes the change in the rate of phosphorus supply required to maintain that rate of NPP, while also allowing for redox-sensitive changes in sedimentary P cycling. The final relationship describes the weathering-normalized net primary production that is consistent with both budgets. It measures the amplification, $A$, of net primary production by nutrient recycling, relative to what is expected from weathering alone. For example, the amplification today is more than 10,000, indicating a world in which NPP is dominated by nutrients supplied via upwelling and remineralization in the photic zone, rather than by the riverine flux.

### 2.2 Two-column mass balance

Changes in the relative importance of the riverine flux suggest a redistribution of NPP toward either river-influenced coastal waters or more distal pelagic waters. These two regions are associated with large differences in average sedimentation rate, which exerts an important control on organic carbon burial independent of redox effects (e.g., Katsev & Crowe, 2015). This suggests potential feedbacks: changes in the rate of net primary production could drive spatial redistributions of productivity that would then cause further changes in the rate of global NPP. To explore how these effects might influence our mass balance results, the model discussed above is generalized to a two-column representation of the ocean.

This model is depicted schematically in Figure 1.

Column A represents coastal regions, with shallow water depth and relatively rapid rates of sedimentation (Sadler, 1999). Net primary production in this region is driven by a combination of coastal upwelling and direct input of nutrients from weathering.

![FIGURE 1 The two-column mass balance model. Each column is associated with its own values of NPP, $f_1$, $f_2$, and $\rho$, though these are not explicitly shown for clarity](image)

Column B represents pelagic regions, characterized by deep water, relatively slow rates of sedimentation, and net primary production that is only driven by upwelling. Both columns are assumed to be in communication with a well-mixed deep-water reservoir of phosphate, which is fed by remineralization in both water columns, and by the diffusion of remineralized P from sediment porewaters. This implies that the steady-state rate of global phosphorus upwelling must be equal to the sum of all remineralization processes minus the rate of authigenic P mineral formation. A fraction $\mu$ of the upwelling volume circulates into the photic zone of column A, with the remainder upwelling in column B.

Note that this model does not account for recycling of nutrients directly in the photic zone, but forces all remineralized P to be redistributed via upwelling. This will tend to give a lower bound on the redistribution of productivity toward coastal areas. Assuming steady-state conditions, it is possible to solve for the amplification factor $\frac{\text{NPP}}{W_p}$ in terms of the column-specific cycling terms, $f_1$, $f_2$, and $\rho$, as shown in the Appendix A.

### 3 RESULTS

We first calculate NPP using the global mass balance model. Figures 2–4 show steady-state NPP, $W_p$, and the amplification...
NPP/W_p as a function of the export and burial efficiencies, and the C_{org}/P ratio. For reference, the modern export and burial efficiencies are estimated at 1% and 10% respectively (Hedges & Keil, 1995). The C_{org}/P ratio, \( \rho \), is more difficult to constrain globally. Estimates based on sediment composition suggest approximately 90% of all P burial is in authigenic forms, suggesting a \( \rho \) value of \( \sim 10 \). Similarly, closing P mass balance (4) with modern rates of net primary productivity (4,000 Tmol C/year; Field et al., 1998) and riverine P inputs (~300 Gmol P/year; Benitez-Nelson, 2000) yields \( \rho = 13 \).

Figure 2 shows the maximum rate of net primary productivity consistent with a low-oxygen atmosphere. This rate decreases as either the export efficiency \( f_1 \) or the burial efficiency \( f_2 \) increases relative to its modern value (Figure 2). For Proterozoic values of these parameters (see Section 4), NPP is between 0.3% and 3% of its modern rate.

Figure 3 shows the maximum rate of bioavailable P supply to the ocean that is consistent with low-oxygen conditions. The weathering or bioavailability of P must decrease as the C_{org}/P ratio in sediments, \( \rho \), increases. Imposing values of \( \rho \) appropriate for low-oxygen conditions (see Section 4), the maximum permissible rate of P supply is between 4% and 13% of its modern value. A variety of mechanisms may drive this change, as discussed below.

Figure 4 shows the rate of NPP that can be sustained at a given rate of nutrient supply, the “amplification factor” \( A = \text{NPP}/\text{W}_p \). At higher export and burial efficiencies, NPP/W_p decreases; at higher values of the C_{org}/P ratio, NPP/W_p increases. The effects of \( f_1 \) and \( f_2 \) dominate over the effect of \( \rho \), in the sense that the majority of the parameter space explored has amplification factors several times smaller than the modern value of \( \sim 10,000 \), ranging from 300 to 7,500.

We also calculate NPP in the two-column model, allowing burial and export efficiencies to vary away from modern values only in the pelagic realm; coastal burial efficiencies are fixed at \( f_1 = 0.25 \) and \( f_2 = 0.3 \) (based on Dunne et al., 2007). This reflects the relative insensitivity of shallow, rapidly accumulating sediments to variations in redox conditions (Katsev & Crowe, 2015). \( \rho \) is set to 13 in both columns. Figure 5 shows the change in weathering-normalized NPP for different values of the deep-water export efficiency. As burial of organic carbon becomes more efficient, P regeneration decreases and...
NPP shifts toward the shallow-water column, making it less sensitive to the oxygen-driven changes in pelagic carbon cycling. Therefore, NPP varies less strongly than in the global model.

4 | DISCUSSION

The magnitude of NPP must decrease as organic carbon is buried more efficiently (larger \( f_1 \) or \( f_2 \)). This is a consequence of balancing the oxygen budget under low-oxygen conditions, when the rate of oxygen loss is generally lower. To prevent unbalanced oxygen generation, the rate of organic carbon burial must also be lower. This is only possible if the large burial efficiencies found in anoxic environments are offset by low rates of NPP. The rate of organic carbon burial also sets the rate of P burial for a given value of the \( \frac{C_{org}}{P} \) ratio (\( \rho \)) in sediments. At steady state, bio-available P input via weathering must be equal to burial, so the larger values of \( \rho \) expected in an anoxic world require lower rates of phosphorus weathering in order to maintain steady state. Changes in both NPP and weathering will influence the fraction of productivity that is fueled by riverine input, rather than nutrient regeneration, potentially altering the spatial distribution of net primary production.

All these cycling processes—export, burial, and regeneration for both C and P—are oxygen sensitive, suggesting that productivity and nutrient supply may have varied, potentially by orders of magnitude (Figures 2–4), as oxygen levels varied over Earth history. However, the sign and magnitude of these changes differ between processes.

**FIGURE 5** Net primary production, normalized to weathering, calculated in both the global and two-column models, for variations in \( f_1 \), the export efficiency. “\( f_1 \)” here refers to its global value in the global model and its pelagic value in the two-column model. The “modern” value of \( f_2 \) is chosen to give a global average burial of 0.01 in both cases. All calculations have a globally averaged \( f_1 \) of 0.1, and \( \rho = 13 \). Coastal production is dominated by riverine inputs of nutrients, \( \mu = 0 \).

### 4.1 Carbon cycling in a low-oxygen world

Organic carbon is buried more efficiently in low-oxygen environments (e.g., Hartnett et al., 1998; Katsev & Crowe, 2015) such as those of the Proterozoic and Archean. Some authors have argued that burial efficiency is not particularly sensitive to oxygen concentrations, due increased activity by methanogens in low-oxygen and particularly low-sulfate environments (e.g., Habicht, Gade, Thamdrup, Berg, & Canfield, 2002; Pavlov, Hurtgen, Kasting, & Arthur, 2003). However, results from modern marine sediments (Katsev & Crowe, 2015) and from anoxic, sulfate-poor lakes such as Lake Matano (Kuntz, Laakso, Schrag, & Crowe, 2015), are consistent with increased burial efficiency in environments poor in electron acceptors. Lake Matano, for example, has burial efficiencies of more than 80%, relative to the material exported from the oxidized surface layer (Kuntz et al., 2015). This very high burial efficiency is maintained despite ongoing methanogenesis, which is in fact the dominant pathway of organic carbon degradation (Kuntz et al., 2015). These observations suggest that burial efficiencies in the low-sulfate, ferruginous oceans of the Proterozoic (Kah, Lyons, & Frank, 2004; Poulton & Canfield, 2011) may have been quite high. In the Archean eon, when surface oxygen concentrations were many orders of magnitude smaller than they are today (Pavlov & Kasting, 2002), and at least 100 times lower than during the Proterozoic (Planavsky et al., 2014), burial efficiencies may have been higher still.

While environments like Lake Matano provide one estimate of burial efficiencies in the Proterozoic, we can use modern oxygen-poor (but sulfate-rich) marine settings to find lower bounds on ancient burial efficiencies, and thus upper bounds on NPP. The export of biomass through the water column to the seafloor becomes more efficient in low-oxygen environments (i.e., \( f_1 \) increases). The degree of organic matter preservation as it sinks through the water column is typically expressed in terms of a power law, following Martin, Knauner, Karl, and Broenkow (1987), which relates the flux of sinking organic matter, \( F \), to depth:

\[
F(z) = F_0 z^{-b}
\]

where \( F_0 \) is the organic flux at 100 m depth, and \( z \) is the depth expressed in hundreds of meters. Van Mooy et al. (2002) find that the attenuation coefficient \( b \) in a suboxic water column is only half the value of the global average taken over oxic waters (0.4 vs. 0.8). These values can be used to compare oxic and suboxic water columns, but Martin’s law is not meant to apply in the photic zone, where competing production and respiration make export rates more difficult to determine. However, if one assumes the average depth of net primary production is 10 m, the power law yields an export efficiency of 20% at 100 m, and 1% export to the average seafloor depth of 4,000 m, both consistent with observations (e.g., Dunne et al., 2007). Applying the low-oxygen attenuation coefficient gives 40% export from the surface and 10% burial at the seafloor; despite the relatively large rate of oxidation in the surface ocean, overall burial efficiency \( f_1 \) increases tenfold.

This is likely a lower bound on export in the Proterozoic. Though debate continues over the exact level of \( pO_2 \) in the Proterozoic
atmosphere (e.g., Planavsky et al., 2014), and over the prevalence of
deep-water euxinia (e.g., Sperling et al., 2015), the entire Proterozoic
water column was likely less oxidized than the modern suboxic water
mass used to derive our “low-oxygen” organic turnover rates. Van
Mooy et al. (2002) calculate their attenuation coefficients from
a site off the Pacific coast of Mexico, where oxygen levels do
approach zero for several hundred meters, but increase again to almost
50 μM at depth. This oxygen level exceeds even the upper bound on
Proterozoic surface waters (Sperling et al., 2015). It also reflects con-
ditions that are almost certainly more oxidizing than the Precambrian
deep ocean. Both ophiolites (Stolper & Keller, 2018) and iron specia-
pion (Poulton & Canfield, 2011) indicate that the Proterozoic deep
was anoxic and ferruginous, and sulfate levels were most
likely less than today (Kah et al., 2004). The lack of oxidants suggests
more efficient organic carbon burial (Katsev & Crowe, 2015; see also
Kipp & Stüeken, 2017) even if methanogenesis rates were elevated
in the oxidant-poor environment (e.g., Kuntz et al., 2015). Both our
deep-water export and global burial efficiencies are therefore likely
to be underestimated.

The preservation of organic matter in the sediments is also
typically more efficient in low-oxygen environments due to slower
remineralization kinetics or decreased oxygen exposure time (i.e., \( f_2 \)
increases; e.g., Hartnett, Keil, Hedges, & Devol, 1998). A comparison
of modernoxic and euxinic sediments suggests that sediments under-
lyng oxygen-free waters can have burial efficiencies more than
ten times greater than oxic sediments, though the effect becomes
weaker for larger sedimentation rates (Canfield, 1994). Using fits to
this data (Katsev & Crowe, 2015), a modern global value of the burial
efficiency (10%) is best represented by oxic sediments with a sedi-
mentation rate of roughly 0.01 g cm\(^{-2}\) year\(^{-1}\). Anoxic sediments with
a similar sedimentation rate have a burial efficiency of ~40% or a
fourfold increase.

These modern euxinic sediments are not likely to be repre-
sentative of Proterozoic conditions, as they generally have high-sulfate
water diffusing downward, which supplies an alternate electron ac-
tector for degrading organic carbon. For comparison, Lake Matano,
which has a sedimentation rate of order 0.01 g cm\(^{-2}\) year\(^{-1}\), has
burial efficiencies in the range 80%–90% (Kuntz et al., 2015), so the
results from modern marine environments are likely to be a lower
bound on burial rates.

The \( C_{org} - P_{\Sigma} \) ratio, \( \rho \), in sediment, is the result of several different
physical processes. Following deposition of organic matter, remi-
neralization liberates both C and P to porewater, but not necessarily in
the same ratio at which they are deposited; early preferential remi-
neralization of P-rich compounds, for example, appear to cause a
spike in the C:P ratio of the remaining organic matter in immature
sediments, though this typically relaxes back toward lower values
over time (Anderson et al., 2001). Inorganic P may then either dif-
use back to the water column or be retained in authigenic minerals
such as fluorapatite (e.g., Ruttenberg & Berner, 1993). The net
result of these processes appears to depend on a number of factors
including redox state, sedimentation rate, and degree of bioturba-
tion. Nevertheless, most observations suggest that the retention
of P increases under more oxic conditions (Algeo & Ingall, 2007), at
least in part due to more efficient trapping of phosphate via sorption
to iron particles (Colman & Holland, 2000). Though individual sites
may show both very high and very low ratios (e.g., Anderson et al.,
2001), a compilation of sediments by Algeo and Ingall (2007) show
an average increase in \( C_{org} - P_{\Sigma} \) from ~10 in highly oxidized sediments,
suggesting extensive remineralization and trapping of P, to 100–300
in euxinic basins, suggesting remineralization of P-rich compounds
followed by some degree of diffusive loss to the water column.

Though \( \rho \) is not directly coupled to the C:P ratio of freshly depos-
ited organic matter, a biologically mediated increase in this ratio
in response to nutrient-poor conditions (e.g., Reinhard et al., 2017,
and discussion below), may have translated into additional overall
increases in \( C_{org} - P_{\Sigma} \).

4.2 | The rate of productivity in a low-oxygen world
Given that export and burial efficiencies do increase under low-
oxidation levels, as shown by Kipp and Stüeken (2017) recently
pointed out that a shortage of electron acceptors before
the Phanerozoic would necessarily lead to nutrient-depleted deep
waters, low rates of P upwelling, and thus reduced NPP. This is con-
sistent with our calculations, based on closing the redox budget
under variable remineralization rates. However, these changes to
the carbon cycle imply changes to phosphorus cycling that are not
necessarily at steady state, and so cannot be considered in isola-
tion. The decrease in P retention expected in the low-oxygen envi-
ronment suggests that, if organic carbon burial is reduced (or even
kept constant) by trade-offs between NPP and burial efficiency, P
will accumulate in the water column, increasing NPP and disrupting
the redox balance. The solution to this problem is to invoke a smaller
supply of bioavailable phosphorus (Figure 3), such that the reduction
in P burial expected in a low P\(_2\)O\(_5\) environment does not result in
growth of the marine P reservoir and subsequent unbalanced oxy-
gen production.

A reduction in the Proterozoic P supply may have been medi-
ated by increased sorptive scavenging in rivers, reducing the sup-
ply of bioavailable P to the ocean without altering the weathering
rate itself (Laakso & Schrag, 2014). Inorganic scavenging from the
maritime water column is not an important P sink today (e.g., Benitez-
Nelson, 2000), but an increased role for such an effect would also
suppress oxygen burial without violating the phosphorus bud-
get, specifically by adding an additional sink to the P mass balance
(Equation 4). Mechanisms for scavenging P from an anoxic water
column include precipitation of ferruginous phosphate phases such
as green rust (Haley, Alesker, Schuster, Popovitz-Biro, & Feldman,
2017) or vivianite (Derry, 2015), and lead to stable low-oxygen con-
ditions in global redox models (Reinhard et al., 2017). Each of these
mechanisms is potentially sensitive to oxygen levels, suggesting that
low-oxygen conditions sustained themselves via a positive feedback
in which abundant ferrous iron suppressed the bioavailability of
phosphate.

These results can be compared to simulations of Proterozoic
biogeochemical cycles in a more complex biogeochemical model
(Laakso & Schrag, 2017). This model is a two-box ocean with sim-
ple linear relationships between oxygen and respiration rates, but
also includes remineralization processes other than oxic respiration,
such as sulfate- and iron-reduction and methanogenesis, and allows
for oxygen-sensitive formation of authigenic apatites. Net primary
production in steady-state simulations of both eons gives primary
productivity of 0.1% of the simulated modern value. The supply of
bioavailable P from weathering is 15% of modern, which is required
to achieve stability at low pO2 (see Section 2), so the weathering-normalized NPP is about 0.7% of the modern value, comparable to the values derived above.

Though there are no direct measurements of Proterozoic NPP
with which to compare, a recent analysis of minor oxygen isotopes
in sulfates suggests that the Mesoproterozoic rate of gross primary
productivity (GPP) was 2-20 times slower than the modern value
(Crockford et al., 2018). Though it is difficult to infer NPP from GPP
in a marine ecosystem of different scale, distribution, and species
composition than that of the modern ocean, a severe slow-down in
GPP is consistent with a reduction in NPP, as predicted here.

4.3 The distribution of productivity in a low-
oxygen world

A tenfold to one hundredfold reduction in primary productivity
implies major changes to the marine carbon cycle. The deep ocean
would be starved of phosphate by the reduction in nutrient recy-
cling; in order to decrease productivity by a factor of 100, nutrient
upwelling needs to be 100 times slower than it is today, requiring
deep-water phosphorus concentrations of only 20 nM (assuming
identical circulation). Today, upwelling accounts for >95% of pro-
ductivity, mostly into pelagic waters. Upwelling is relatively intense
in coastal areas, but diffuse upwelling of deep-water phosphate
still occurs widely, with 90% of productivity occurring in waters of
>2,000 m depth, and 95% in waters of >200 m depth (Dunne et al.,
2007). A decrease in the nutrient content of Proterozoic upwelling
implies that riverine inputs of newly weathered phosphate would
become a much larger fraction of total P supply to the photic zone,
shifting the locus of NPP away from open waters and toward the
coasts. This effect is partially offset by the reduction in weather-
ing required to balance the P budget, described above. However,
even after accounting for this effect, weathering likely drove ~30%
of NPP during the Proterozoic (Figure 3), suggesting a marine bio-
sphere more tightly distributed along coasts.

Shallow-water coastal regions are associated with more rapid
sedimentation (Sadler, 1999).

The burial efficiency fb is less sensitive to oxygen levels in
areas of high sedimentation rate (Katsev & Crowe, 2015).
Furthermore, the very shallow-water column was likely weakly
oxic even in the Proterozoic, when it would have been in equi-
lbrium with an atmosphere at 1%-10% present atmospheric lev-
els of O2 (Lyons et al., 2014). Taking this logic to its extreme, one
could argue that, if oxygen levels drop and NPP retreats toward
the coasts, it becomes increasingly insensitive to the change in
pO2, acting to stabilize productivity against further changes (see
related arguments made by Katsev & Crowe, 2015). The combina-
tion of these two effects does make NPP slightly less responsive
to changes in the burial efficiency, as demonstrated by Figure 5.
However, the net effect is to increase NPP by at most a few tens
of percent over the range of burial efficiencies explored; the total
drop in weathering-normalized NPP is still an order of magnitude
relative to the modern day.

The low productivity biosphere described here is a steady-state
solution that is consistent with low levels of pO2 in the ocean and
atmosphere. It also a stable biogeochemical cycle, as long as phos-
phorus inputs are held at low levels. Removing the steady-state
assumption and linearizing the rates of change in the oxygen and
phosphate reservoirs around the Proterozoic steady state, we find
that oxygen levels are stable as long as the Corg/P ratio decreases
with increasing oxygenation (see Appendix A), as is seen in mod-
ern environments (Algeo & Ingall, 2007). This negative feedback, in
which rising O2 leads to increased P retention, decreased organic
carbon burial, and ultimately less oxygen production, has been in-
voked several times to explain the stability of Phanerozoic oxygen
levels (e.g., Algeo & Ingall, 2007).

An interesting aspect of a coastally oriented biosphere is that
the bulk of organic carbon cycling takes place in the oxidized sur-
face environment, despite the continental slope and deep ocean
being largely anoxic (e.g., Sperling et al., 2015). A transient in-
crease in surface pO2 will lead to increased nutrient regeneration
and a larger marine P reservoir, which allows for more upwelling
and a distribution of productivity away from the coasts and toward
anoxic deep waters. This suggests that rising oxygen levels could
result in organic carbon cycling shifting toward lower oxygen en-
vironments, increasing globally averaged P retention rates even as
local shallow-water retention is depressed. Such a sequence of
events is a positive feedback or at least a weakening of the nega-
tive feedback described above. Therefore, transient perturbations
to pO2 may have been only weakly suppressed, potentially allow-
ing for large transient excursions in oxygen levels (Appendix A).
Note that this behavior is a consequence of an ocean with a rela-
tively strong depth gradient in oxidant availability, is therefore
likely to be unique to Proterozoic Eon. This may explain the observed variability of redox conditions in Neoproterozoic sections (Johnston et al., 2012). Stress resulting from variable oxygen levels has been linked to the late appearance of larger organisms relative to the Mesoproterozoic provenance of eukaryotes (Javaux, Knoll, & Malcolm, 2001), especially given the tolerance for moderate dysoxia among some modern (Sperling et al., 2013) and early (Mills et al., 2018) animals.

A retraction of nutrient supplies and net primary production toward the coasts may also help explain the decreased diversity of eukaryotes in deeper water sections of the Proterozoic (Javaux et al., 2001). Low phosphate concentrations would also have favored cyanobacteria over photosynthetic eukaryotes (Brocks et al., 2017), preventing a significant contribution to productivity from algae during the Mesoproterozoic (Knoll, Summons, Waldbauer, & Zumbruge, 2007). Once oxygen levels rose, possibly following the Cryogenian glaciations as suggested by trace metal proxies (Lyons et al., 2014), and definitively by the Silurian (Sperling et al., 2015), the resulting decrease in organic carbon burial, phosphorus regeneration, and NPP, may have created more favorable conditions for the expansion of algae and other eukaryotes into a wider range of marine environments.

5 | CONCLUSIONS

Mass balance calculations presented here suggest that the global rate of net primary productivity was at least ten times smaller in the Proterozoic than today, and more likely 100 times smaller, or <50 Tmol C/year. Riverine inputs of phosphorus alone are enough to drive more than 30% of this productivity, leading to a marine biosphere that was strongly concentrated along coastal zones, and in particular near river outflows.

A predominantly coastal, shallow-water marine biosphere suggests that biogeochemical cycling may not have been exposed to the deep-water ferruginous conditions thought to have been widespread throughout the Proterozoic (Sperling et al., 2015). Though only the surface ocean was likely to have been oxic (Poulton et al., 2010), biogeochemical processes would have been disproportionately distributed into oxic surface waters and shallow coastal sediments. This has implications not only for carbon, phosphorus, and oxygen cycling, but for the cycles of iron and sulfate. For example, efficient burial of largely undegraded carbon in areas of rapid sedimentation should result in largely anoxic sediments with high concentrations of very labile organic carbon. This may help explain how the ocean was able to maintain sulfate reduction rates sufficient to balance sulfur inputs exclusively with pyrite burial (Fike et al., 2015), despite low concentrations of seawater sulfate.

The sedimentary record is biased toward shallow-water environments that are less likely to have been subducted on geologic timescales. The focusing of NPP toward coastal and estuarine environments means that preserved sediments are likely to record relatively high organic carbon contents or minerals and isotopic signatures associated with organic-rich sediments. Nevertheless, the Proterozoic ocean as a whole was most likely a world of limited marine life, with rates of productivity and heterotrophy at least order of magnitude smaller than today, and an open ocean that was poor in nutrients, biomass, and life.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by Henry and Wendy Breck and the Simons Foundation. Portions of this work were supported by NASA Headquarters under the NASA Earth and Space Science Fellowship Program Grant NNX11AP89H.

ORCID

Thomas A. Laakso http://orcid.org/0000-0002-2755-8050

REFERENCES


https://doi.org/10.1016/0198-0149(87)90086-0


APPENDIX A

Methods Appendix

A.1 | NPP/Wp IN THE TWO-COLUMN MODEL

We first calculate effective weighted global values of the burial efficiency terms by taking a production-weighted average of the two columns:

\[
f_1 = \frac{C \text{ deposition on sediments}}{NPP} = \frac{f_1^2 N_A^2 + f_1^2 N_B^2}{N_A^2 + N_B^2}
\]

\[
f_2 = \frac{\text{organic C burial}}{C \text{ deposition on sediments}} = \frac{(f_2 f_2^2 N_A^2 + f_2^2 f_3^2 N_B^2)}{f_2^2 N_A^2 + f_3^2 N_B^2}
\]

How to cite this article: Laakso TA, Schrag DP. A small marine biosphere in the Proterozoic. *Geobiology*. 2018;00:1–11. https://doi.org/10.1111/gbi.12323
\[
\rho = \frac{\text{organic C burial}}{\text{total P burial}} = \frac{(f_1 f_2)^A N^A + (f_1 f_2)^B N^B}{(f_1 f_2)^A N^A + (f_1 f_2)^B N^B}
\]

where superscripts denote the two different columns, and \( N \) is shorthand for NPP. We can define the fraction of total net primary production that takes place in coastal waters as \( \sigma = N^A/N \), giving:

\[
f_1 = \sigma f_1^A + (1-\sigma)f_1^B
\]

\[
f_2 = \frac{\sigma(f_1 f_2)^A + (1-\sigma)(f_1 f_2)^B}{f_1}
\]

\[
\rho = \frac{\sigma^A \rho^B}{\sigma(f_1 f_2)^A \rho^B + (1-\sigma)(f_1 f_2)^B \rho^A f_1 f_2}
\]

Assuming steady-state P cycling in the photic zone:

\[
N = r W_p + r U
\]

\[
\Rightarrow U = \frac{\epsilon - \epsilon_{\text{org}}}{\epsilon_{\text{org}}} W_p
\]

where \( U \) is the rate of P upwelling, and we have applied results from the Section 2.

Defining \( \mu \) as the fraction of total upwelling that takes place in column A, \( \mu = U^A/U \):

\[
\sigma = \frac{N^A}{N} = \frac{W_p + U^A}{W_p + U} = \left( \mu + \frac{\epsilon_{\text{org}}}{\rho} (1-\mu) \right)
\]

Substituting the definition of \( \epsilon \) and solving for \( \sigma \) yields:

\[
\sigma = \frac{\mu + r (1-\mu) \left( \frac{U^A}{U} \right)^B}{1 - r (1-\mu) \left( \left( \frac{U^A}{U} \right)^A - \left( \frac{U^A}{U} \right)^B \right)}
\]

This can be substituted into the equations for the effective global \( f_1, f_2 \), and \( \rho \), giving a closed form for the weathering-normalized NPP via the results derived in the Section 2:

\[
\text{NPP} = \frac{f_1 f_2}{\rho}
\]

A.2 | STABILITY ANALYSIS

Letting \( p \) represent the dissolved phosphate reservoir and \( x \) the total oceanic and atmospheric \( \text{O}_2 \) inventory:

\[
x = \epsilon_{\text{org}} \text{NPP} - g
\]

\[
p = W_p - \frac{1}{\rho} \epsilon_{\text{org}} \text{NPP}
\]

Assuming that net primary production is phosphorus limited and that nutrient uptake is sufficiently rapid to maintain photic zone P concentrations near zero:

\[
\text{NPP} = r \epsilon_{\text{org}} (W_p + u \cdot p)
\]

where \( u \) is the upwelling rate.

\[
x = r \epsilon_{\text{org}} (W_p + u \cdot p) - g
\]

\[
\rho = W_p (1 - \epsilon_p) - \rho \epsilon_{\text{org}} \cdot p
\]

with \( \epsilon_p = (r/u) \epsilon_{\text{org}}. \) Taylor expanding with respect to both variables around the steady-state solution \( x = x_0, p = p_0 \):

\[
x = \left. \frac{d}{dx} \right|_{0} (x - x_0) + \left. \frac{d}{dp} \right|_{0} (p - p_0)
\]

\[
= (x - x_0) \left( -\frac{d}{dx} \left. \frac{r W_p d}{\epsilon_{\text{org}} \epsilon_p} \right|_{0} + (p - p_0) (u \epsilon_{\text{org}}) \right)
\]

\[
\rho = \left. \frac{d}{dx} \right|_{0} (x - x_0) + \left. \frac{d}{dp} \right|_{0} (p - p_0)
\]

\[
= (x - x_0) \left( -W_p \left. \frac{d}{dx} \frac{r W_p}{\epsilon_{\text{org}} \epsilon_p} \right|_{0} + (p - p_0) (u \epsilon_{\text{org}}) \right)
\]

where \( z |_{0} \) indicates \( z \) evaluated at \( x = x_0, p = p_0 \). Letting \( y = x - x_0 \) and \( q = p - p_0 \):

\[
\left( \begin{array}{c} y \\ q \end{array} \right) = \left( \begin{array}{cc} -\alpha & \beta \\ \gamma & \delta \end{array} \right) \left( \begin{array}{c} y \\ q \end{array} \right)
\]

where

\[
\alpha = \left. \frac{d}{dx} \right|_{0} -r W_p \frac{\epsilon_{\text{org}}}{\epsilon_p} \left. \frac{d}{dx} \ln \epsilon_{\text{org}} \right|_{0}
\]

\[
\beta = r W_p \frac{\epsilon_{\text{org}}}{\epsilon_p} \left. \frac{d}{dx} \ln \epsilon_{\text{org}} \right|_{0}
\]

\[
\gamma = -W_p \left. \frac{d}{dx} \ln \epsilon_{\text{org}} \right|_{0}
\]

\[
\delta = u \epsilon_{\text{org}} \left. \frac{d}{dx} \ln \epsilon_{\text{org}} \right|_{0}
\]

Note that \( \alpha, \beta, \) and \( \delta \) are always positive; the sign of \( \gamma \) is addressed below. The solutions to such a system have terms that scale as \( e^{\lambda t} \), where \( \lambda \) are the eigenvalues of matrix above. Therefore, the steady state \( x = x_0, p = p_0 \) is stable as long as the real parts of the eigenvalues are positive.

\[
2 \lambda = - (\alpha + \delta) \pm (\alpha + \delta)^2 - 4 (\alpha \delta - \beta \gamma)^{1/2}
\]

Negative eigenvalues can occur when \( \alpha \delta < \beta \gamma \), or:

\[
\left. \frac{d}{dx} \right|_{0} < r W_p \left. \frac{\epsilon_{\text{org}}}{\epsilon_p} \frac{d}{dx} (\ln \epsilon_{\text{org}} - \ln \epsilon_{\text{org}}) \right|_{0}
\]

Noting that steady state for the entire system requires:
The condition for unstable solutions becomes
\[
\begin{align*}
\frac{d}{dx} \ln g \bigg|_{x=0} &< \frac{r_{\text{org}}}{\rho^2} \frac{d}{dx} \rho \bigg|_{x=0} \\
\end{align*}
\]

The left-hand side is always positive, which implies the system can only be unstable if:
\[
\frac{d}{dx} \rho \bigg|_{x=0} > 0
\]

At individual sites, \( \rho \) decreases with the oxygen concentration of the overlying water column (Algeo & Ingall, 2007), suggesting that oxygen levels are generally stable. However, a change in the distribution of organic carbon deposition may have more complex effects on the globally averaged value of \( \rho \) (see main text). Note that if the fixed point is unstable, this does not necessarily imply unbounded growth of a perturbation, as sufficiently large excursions will move the system outside of the domain in which the linearized dynamics are an accurate description of the system. Identifying this domain and the behavior outside of it will require a more detailed understanding of how the globally averaged value of \( \rho \) varies with oxygen levels.