



The mindful migraine: does mindfulness-based stress reduction relieve episodic migraine?

Vitaly Napadow^{a,b}

Migraine is a leading cause of disability worldwide, with episodic headaches, sensory sensitivity, nausea, and vomiting imparting significant morbidity and even frequent bed rest during an attack.^{1,13} We also know that psychosocial factors can be important modifiers and even triggers of migraine attacks. For instance, perceived stress has been reported as the most common trigger of migraine headaches.²² Hence, interventions that target stress should naturally be considered for the clinical management of migraine. Such interventions include integrative medicine therapies, which are used by about half of all patients suffering from migraines or severe headaches, and include mind–body therapies such as meditation training.²⁶

Mindfulness meditation training is a promising mind–body therapy for migraine^{7,27} and other chronic pain disorders.²³ Specifically, mindfulness meditation encourages nonjudgmental awareness and acceptance towards inner experiences (thoughts and emotions) and physical sensations. In fact, this intervention encompasses various techniques, including focused awareness of sensory, emotional, and cognitive events, and open monitoring, in a nonevaluative manner,^{8,10} likely relying on top–down brain-based mechanisms of action.^{11,28} As pain experience involves unpleasant sensory and emotional experiences and is strongly influenced by negatively valenced evaluative processes,^{4,5} mindfulness meditation has significant potential to shape the chronic pain experience.

Perhaps the most common manualized mindfulness meditation training protocol is mindfulness-based stress reduction (MBSR), an 8-week empirically supported group education intervention demonstrated to enhance emotion regulation and reduce pain.⁶ In fact, the first mindfulness meditation research trial was conducted specifically for chronic pain patients by Jon Kabat-Zinn¹², the founder of MBSR, in 1982, and recent large N clinical trials have shown promise for clinical pain reduction.^{2,3,16,17,23} However, the neural mechanisms supporting MBSR-mediated pain relief are poorly understood.²⁹

With this in mind, Seminowicz et al.²⁴ have now published the results of perhaps the largest MBSR study for migraine headache. In this important study, episodic migraine patients experienced an enhanced form of mindfulness meditation training, whereas the control group experienced a series of stress management classes. Specifically, their MBSR intervention included an additional 8 weeks

of biweekly visits, beyond the typical 8-week weekly format, hence dubbed MBSR+. The stress management control intervention included 12 didactic sessions over 4 months and, in contrast to MBSR+, did not include a retreat. The authors also assessed multiple MRI brain-imaging outcomes—gray matter volume and functional MRI (fMRI) resting brain connectivity metrics for dorsal lateral prefrontal cortex, a critical pain downregulatory brain region,²⁵ as well as block design fMRI for a cognitive (multisource interference) task, and thermal evoked-pain stimulation. Outcomes were collected at baseline and at 20 weeks (ie, post-therapy). Long-term clinical outcomes were also assessed at 52 weeks.

The study demonstrated reduction in the primary clinical outcome, number of headache days per month, from baseline to 20 weeks for both MBSR+ and stress management control, with a significantly larger effect size for MBSR+. In fact, 52% of the MBSR+ group was classified as responders compared with 23% in the stress management control group. Migraine patients randomized to MBSR+ also reported greater reduction in headache-related disability (assess by the 6-item Headache Impact Text)—a very important functional outcome. However, by 52 weeks, there were no differences between the MBSR+ and stress management control groups in clinical outcomes. Importantly here, reduced headache frequency at 20 weeks for the MBSR+ group was still reduced at 52 weeks, while headache frequency for the control group showed a slower reduction, leading to a nonsignificant difference at 52 weeks.

Unfortunately, the a priori hypothesized primary structural and fMRI outcomes did not show a significant group × time interaction, and imaging outcomes were not explicitly associated with clinical improvements, limiting our understanding of the brain-based mechanisms that may have contributed to the intriguing clinical improvements. The authors did note some secondary imaging outcomes with a group × time interaction. Compared with stress management control, migraineurs randomized to MBSR+ showed reduced post-therapy fMRI response to the cognitive task in the cuneus and parietal operculum. This result was interpreted as reflecting improved cognitive efficiency. Migraineurs also showed reduced post-MBSR+ resting fMRI connectivity between dorsal anterior insula and both cuneus and superior parietal lobule. The cuneus is an occipital cortical region important for visual processing, and perhaps future studies can explore if changes in such visual processing regions are linked to the existence or improvements in visual aura, a hallmark of cortical spreading depression and common prequel to migraine headache for many patients. Interestingly, the authors noted that these fMRI changes may reflect either the effects of MBSR training or result from reduced migraine attacks. Perhaps explicitly linking these imaging changes with changes in migraine attacks per month across different patients in this study could better tease apart these 2 scenarios.

Sponsorships or competing interests that may be relevant to content are disclosed at the end of this article.

^a Department of Radiology, Athinoula A. Martinos Center for Biomedical Imaging, Massachusetts General Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Charlestown, MA, United States, ^b Department of Anesthesiology, Pain Management Center, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Chestnut Hill, MA, United States
PAIN 161 (2020) 1685–1687

© 2020 International Association for the Study of Pain
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/j.pain.0000000000001859>

However, dorsal lateral prefrontal cortex gray matter volume or resting connectivity did not demonstrate interesting longitudinal changes in this study on the whole brain level, whereas changes in brain processing of heat pain were also not different between groups. The authors provocatively note that their primary imaging outcomes, developed following previous studies contrasting chronic pain patients with healthy adults, may not be the appropriate targets for longitudinal treatment studies. Although this may indeed be true for the outcomes evaluated in this study, our group has demonstrated several outcomes, such as functional connectivity between default mode network regions and anterior/midinsula in fibromyalgia patients^{9,19,20} and S1 neuroplasticity in carpal tunnel syndrome patients,^{14,15,18,21} that both differed between chronic pain patients and healthy adults and were altered toward the pattern found in healthy adults after successful nonpharmacological or even pharmacological therapy. Ultimately, as this study by Seminowicz et al. has generated a very rich data set with clinical and imaging outcomes for episodic migraine, there is hope that future analyses may directly link these outcomes for responders vs nonresponders, perhaps yielding a better understanding of the brain mechanisms supporting longitudinal improvements in migraine severity after MBSR. We should also not lose sight of the important conclusion that MBSR+ was indeed found to be an effective treatment option for episodic migraine, above and beyond an active control intervention.

Conflict of interest statement

The author has no conflicts of interest to declare.

Acknowledgements

The author was supported by the following NIH grants: National Center for Complementary and Integrative Health (NCCIH), NIH (P01-AT009965, R61-AT009306, R33-AT009306, R01-AT007550); National Institute for Arthritis and Musculoskeletal and Skin Diseases (NIAMS), NIH (R01-AR064367).

Article history:

Received 26 February 2020

Accepted 2 March 2020

Available online 4 March 2020

References

- [1] Burch RC, Buse DC, Lipton RB. Migraine: epidemiology, burden, and comorbidity. *Neurol Clin* 2019;37:631–49.
- [2] Cherkin DC, Anderson ML, Sherman KJ, Balderson BH, Cook AJ, Hansen KE, Turner JA. Two-year follow-up of a randomized clinical trial of mindfulness-based stress reduction vs cognitive behavioral therapy or usual care for chronic low back pain. *JAMA* 2017;317:642–4.
- [3] Cherkin DC, Sherman KJ, Balderson BH, Cook AJ, Anderson ML, Hawkes RJ, Hansen KE, Turner JA. Effect of mindfulness-based stress reduction vs cognitive behavioral therapy or usual care on back pain and functional limitations in adults with chronic low back pain: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA* 2016;315:1240–9.
- [4] Edwards RR, Calahan C, Mensing G, Smith M, Haythornthwaite JA. Pain, catastrophizing, and depression in the rheumatic diseases. *Nat Rev Rheumatol* 2011;7:216–24.
- [5] Edwards RR, Dworkin RH, Sullivan MD, Turk DC, Wasan AD. The role of psychosocial processes in the development and maintenance of chronic pain. *J Pain* 2016;17(9 suppl):T70–92.
- [6] Goyal M, Singh S, Sibinga EM, Gould NF, Rowland-Seymour A, Sharma R, Berger Z, Sleicher D, Maron DD, Shihab HM, Ranasinghe PD, Linn S, Saha S, Bass EB, Haythornthwaite JA. Meditation programs for psychological stress and well-being: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA Intern Med* 2014;174:357–68.
- [7] Grazzi L, Sansone E, Raggi A, D'Amico D, De Giorgio A, Leonardi M, De Torres L, Salgado-Garcia F, Andrasik F. Mindfulness and pharmacological prophylaxis after withdrawal from medication overuse in patients with chronic migraine: an effectiveness trial with a one-year follow-up. *J Headache Pain* 2017;18:15.
- [8] Gu J, Strauss C, Bond R, Cavanagh K. How do mindfulness-based cognitive therapy and mindfulness-based stress reduction improve mental health and wellbeing? A systematic review and meta-analysis of mediation studies. *Clin Psychol Rev* 2015;37:1–12.
- [9] Harris RE, Napadow V, Huggins JP, Pauer L, Kim J, Hampson J, Sundgren PC, Foerster B, Petrou M, Schmidt-Wilcke T, Clauw DJ. Pregabalin rectifies aberrant brain chemistry, connectivity, and functional response in chronic pain patients. *Anesthesiology* 2013;119:1453–64.
- [10] Hilton L, Hempel S, Ewing BA, Apaydin E, Xenakis L, Newberry S, Colaiaco B, Maher AR, Shanman RM, Sorbero ME, Maglione MA. Mindfulness meditation for chronic pain: systematic review and meta-analysis. *Ann Behav Med* 2017;51:199–213.
- [11] Holzel BK, Lazar SW, Gard T, Schuman-Olivier Z, Vago DR, Ott U. How does mindfulness meditation work? Proposing mechanisms of action from a conceptual and neural perspective. *Perspect Psychol Sci* 2011;6:537–59.
- [12] Kabat-Zinn J. An outpatient program in behavioral medicine for chronic pain patients based on the practice of mindfulness meditation: theoretical considerations and preliminary results. *Gen Hosp Psychiatry* 1982;4:33–47.
- [13] Lipton RB, Bigal ME, Diamond M, Freitag F, Reed ML, Stewart WF. Migraine prevalence, disease burden, and the need for preventive therapy. *Neurology* 2007;68:343–9.
- [14] Maeda Y, Kettner N, Holden J, Lee J, Kim J, Cina S, Malatesta C, Gerber J, McManus C, Im J, Libby A, Mezzacappa P, Morse LR, Park K, Audette J, Tommerdahl M, Napadow V. Functional deficits in carpal tunnel syndrome reflect reorganization of primary somatosensory cortex. *Brain* 2014;137:1741–52.
- [15] Maeda Y, Kim H, Kettner N, Kim J, Cina S, Malatesta C, Gerber J, McManus C, Ong-Sutherland R, Mezzacappa P, Libby A, Mawla I, Morse LR, Kaptchuk TJ, Audette J, Napadow V. Rewiring the primary somatosensory cortex in carpal tunnel syndrome with acupuncture. *Brain* 2017;140:914–27.
- [16] Morone NE, Greco CM, Moore CG, Rollman BL, Lane B, Morrow LA, Glynn NW, Weiner DK. A mind-body program for older adults with chronic low back pain: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA Intern Med* 2016;176:329–37.
- [17] Morone NE, Greco CM, Weiner DK. Mindfulness meditation for the treatment of chronic low back pain in older adults: a randomized controlled pilot study. *PAIN* 2008;134:310–19.
- [18] Napadow V, Kettner N, Ryan A, Kwong KK, Audette J, Hui KK. Somatosensory cortical plasticity in carpal tunnel syndrome—a cross-sectional fMRI evaluation. *Neuroimage* 2006;31:520–30.
- [19] Napadow V, Kim J, Clauw DJ, Harris RE. Decreased intrinsic brain connectivity is associated with reduced clinical pain in fibromyalgia. *Arthritis Rheum* 2012;64:2398–403.
- [20] Napadow V, LaCount L, Park K, As-Sanie S, Clauw DJ, Harris RE. Intrinsic brain connectivity in fibromyalgia is associated with chronic pain intensity. *Arthritis Rheum* 2010;62:2545–55.
- [21] Napadow V, Liu J, Li M, Kettner N, Ryan A, Kwong KK, Hui KK, Audette JF. Somatosensory cortical plasticity in carpal tunnel syndrome treated by acupuncture. *Hum Brain Mapp* 2007;28:159–71.
- [22] Pellegriano ABW, Davis-Martin RE, Houle TT, Turner DP, Smitherman TA. Perceived triggers of primary headache disorders: a meta-analysis. *Cephalalgia* 2018;38:1188–98.
- [23] Reiner K, Tibi L, Lipsitz JD. Do mindfulness-based interventions reduce pain intensity? A critical review of the literature. *Pain Med* 2013;14:230–42.
- [24] Seminowicz DA, Burrowes SAB, Kearson A, Zhang J, Krimmel SR, Samawi L, Furman AJ, Keaser ML, Gould NF, Magyari T, White L,

- Goloubeva O, Goyal M, Peterlin BL, Haythornthwaite JA. Enhanced mindfulness based stress reduction (MBSR+) in episodic migraine: a randomized clinical trial with MRI outcomes. *PAIN* 2020;161:1837–46.
- [25] Seminowicz DA, Moayed M. The dorsolateral prefrontal cortex in acute and chronic pain. *J Pain* 2017;18:1027–35.
- [26] Wells RE, Bertisch SM, Buettner C, Phillips RS, McCarthy EP. Complementary and alternative medicine use among adults with migraines/severe headaches. *Headache* 2011;51:1087–97.
- [27] Wells RE, Burch R, Paulsen RH, Wayne PM, Houle TT, Loder E. Meditation for migraines: a pilot randomized controlled trial. *Headache* 2014;54:1484–95.
- [28] Zeidan F, Baumgartner JN, Coghill RC. The neural mechanisms of mindfulness-based pain relief: a functional magnetic resonance imaging-based review and primer. *Pain Rep* 2019;4:e759.
- [29] Zeidan F, Vago DR. Mindfulness meditation-based pain relief: a mechanistic account. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 2016;1373:114–27.